

Violet Soen / Alexander Soetaert /
Johan Verberckmoes / Wim François (eds.)

Transregional Reformations

Crossing Borders in Early Modern Europe



Academic Studies

61



Refo500 Academic Studies

Edited by
Herman J. Selderhuis

In Co-operation with
Christopher B. Brown (Boston), Günter Frank (Bretten),
Bruce Gordon (New Haven), Barbara Mahlmann-Bauer (Bern),
Tarald Rasmussen (Oslo), Violet Soen (Leuven),
Zsombor Tóth (Budapest), Günther Wassilowsky (Frankfurt),
Siegfried Westphal (Osnabrück).

Volume 61

Violet Soen/Alexander Soetaert/
Johan Verberckmoes/Wim François (eds.)

Transregional Reformations

Crossing Borders in Early Modern Europe

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek:
The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the
Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data available
online: <http://dnb.de>.

© 2019, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht GmbH & Co. KG, Theaterstraße 13, D-37073 Göttingen
All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any
means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information
storage and retrieval system, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Typesetting: 3w+p, Rimpär
Printed and bound: Hubert & Co. BuchPartner, Göttingen
Printed in the EU

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht Verlage | www.vandenhoeck-ruprecht-verlage.com

ISSN 2197-0165
ISBN 978-3-647-56470-8

Contents

Abbreviations 7

Alexander Soetaert, Violet Soen, Johan Verberckmoes & Wim François
Crossing (Disciplinary) Borders: When Reformation Studies Meet
Transregional History 9

I. Transfer and Exchange

Jonas van Tol
The Rhineland and the Huguenots: Transregional Confessional Relations
During the French Wars of Religion 27

Barbara B. Diefendorf
Localizing a Transregional Catholic Reformation: How Spanish and
Italian Orders Became French 53

Michel Boeglin
Crossing Boundaries: The Reception of Reformed Doctrines in Spain
During the Reign of Emperor Charles V 77

Gábor Ittész
Why Departed Souls Cannot Return: Transregional Migration of a
Reformation Idea in the Sixteenth Century 97

II. Translation and Transmission

Alexandra Walsham
Religious Ventriloquism: Translation, Cultural Exchange and the English
Counter-Reformation 123

Alexander Soetaert	
Transferring Catholic Literature to the British Isles: The Publication of English Translations in the Ecclesiastical Province of Cambrai (c. 1600–50)	157
Zsombor Tóth	
“What do you Read my Lord? Words, Words, Words...”: A Case Study on Translations and Cultural Transfers in Early Modern Eastern Europe .	187
Grażyna Jurkowlaniec	
Printed Images Crossing Borders: An <i>Allegory of the Catholic Church</i> and its Dissemination in Late Sixteenth-Century Europe	205
III. Mobility and Exile	
Kajsa Brilkman	
Boundaries Transcended: Student Mobility, Clerical Marriage and Translations in the Life of the Swedish Reformer Olaus Petri	245
Violet Soen	
Containing Students and Scholars Within Borders? The Foundation of Universities in Reims and Douai and Transregional Transfers in Early Modern Catholicism	267
Timothy J. Orr	
“Even if Fire were Lighted”: Jan Hus and the Decision to Flee or Remain .	295
Johannes M. Müller	
‘Exile Theology’ Beyond Confessional Boundaries: The Example of Dirck Volckertsz. Coornhert	315
Christiaan Ravensbergen	
Language Barriers to Confessional Migration: Reformed Ministers from the Palatinate in the East of the Netherlands (1578)	333
Notes on Contributors	363
Index of Names	367
Index of Places	373

Abbreviations

- ADB** *Allgemeine Deutsche Biographie* (56 vol.; Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, 1875–1912).
- ARCR** A.F. Allison/D.M. Rogers, *The Contemporary Printed Literature of the English Counter-Reformation between 1558 and 1640* (2 vol.; London: Scholar Press, 1989–94).
- BCJ** C. Sommervogel (ed.), *Bibliothèque de la Compagnie de Jésus* (12 vol.; Brussels: Schepens, 1890–1960).
- BPal** *Bibliotheca Palatina: Druckschriften / Stampati Palatini / Printed Books*, microfiche edition, ed. L. Boyle/E. Mittler (Munich: Saur, 1995).
- BR** H. Gunneng, *Biskop Hans Brasks registratur. Textutgåva* (Samlingar utgivna av Svenska fornskriftsällskapet 85; Uppsala: Svenska fornskriftsällskapet, 2003).
- DBA** *Deutsches biographisches Archiv I–III, microfiche edition* (Munich: Saur, 1999–2002), also available online in WBIS.
- EEBO** *Early English Books Online* (<https://eebo.chadwyck.com>).
- HO II** Stanislaus Hosius, *Operum tomus secundus*, ed. Stanisław Reszka (Cologne: Cholinus, 1584).
- LW** *Luther's Works*, ed. J. Pelikan/H.T. Lehmann (55 vol.; Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1957–1986).
- NPNF¹** *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers: A Select Library of the Christian Church*, Series I, ed. Philip Schaff (14 vol.; repr. Peabody: Hendrickson, 1995).
- ODNB** *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*.
- OPSS** Olaus Petri, *Samlade skrifter af Olavus Petri*, ed. B. Hesselman (4 vol.; Uppsala: Sveriges kristliga studentrörelses förlag, 1914–1917).
- PIBA** W. Audenaert, *Prosopographia Iesuitica Belgica Antiqua: a Biographical Dictionary of Jesuits in the Low Countries 1542–1773* (4 vol.; Leuven: Filosofisch en Theologisch College van de Sociëteit van Jezus, 2000).
- VD16** *Verzeichnis der im deutschen Sprachbereich erschienenen Drucke des 16. Jahrhunderts* (www.vd16.de).
- VD17** *Das Verzeichnis der im deutschen Sprachraum erschienenen Drucke des 17. Jahrhunderts* (www.vd17.de).
- WA** *D. Martin Luthers Werke. Kritische Gesamtausgabe* (73 vol.; Weimar: Böhlau, 1883–2009).

Alexander Soetaert, Violet Soen, Johan Verberckmoes
& Wim François

Crossing (Disciplinary) Borders: When Reformation Studies Meet Transregional History

This volume invites Reformation scholars to incorporate recent advances in transnational and entangled history into their own field of research, a crossover which has not yet been explored to its full potential. Some of the hesitation can be explained by the traditional emphasis on cities and states in Reformation history. On the one hand, urban history, more than any other field of historical scholarship, has drawn attention to the importance of cities as centers for religious reformations during the Early Modern Era. Inspired by Bernd Moeller's 1962 classic *Reichsstadt und Reformation*, numerous case studies presented the Reformation (and eventually the Counter Reformation) as the outcome of complex local power struggles between magistrates and citizens, in which urban and clerical elites, literate citizens, and city dwellers both collaborated and collided.¹ On the other hand, the study of Church-State relations, boasting of an even older academic pedigree, has significantly shaped the historiography of the Reformation. An important aspect of the now critically received *Konfessionalisierung*-paradigm, first presented in the 1970s, stresses the far-reaching Church-State collaboration in both Protestant and Catholic regions and highlights the role of princely courts in capital cities, while downplaying developments on the peripheries of state power.² The ensuing focus on cities and capitals prompted

1 B. Moeller, *Reichsstadt und Reformation* (Schriften des Vereins für Reformationsgeschichte 180; Gütersloh: Mohr, 1962). Seminal examples include: P. Benedict, *Rouen during the Wars of Religion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981); A. Lottin, *Lille, citadelle de la Contre Réforme? 1598–1667* (Dunkerque: Westhoek-Éditions, 1984); G. Marnef, *Antwerp in the Age of Reformation: Underground Protestantism in a Commercial Metropolis 1550–1577* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996).

2 T. Brockmann/D.J. Weiss (ed.), *Das Konfessionalisierungsparadigma. Leistungen, Probleme, Grenzen* (Bayreuther Historische Kolloquien 18; Münster: Aschendorff Verlag, 2013); U. Lotz-Heumann, "Confessionalization", in M. Laven/A. Bamji/G.H. Janssen (ed.), *The Ashgate Companion to the Counter-Reformation* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013) 33–53 and P. Marshall, "Confessionalization, Confessionalism and Confusion in the English Reformation", in T. Mayer (ed.), *Reforming Reformation* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013), 43–64; P. Büttgen/C. Duhamelle (ed.), *Religion ou confession. Un bilan franco-allemand sur l'époque moderne (XVIe–XVIIIe siècles)* (Paris: Maison des Sciences de l'homme, 2010).

studies of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century reformations to identify what happened within territorial circumscriptions at a local or regional level; as an alternative, this volume opts to move beyond these boundaries.

Recently, calls to decenter the historiography of early modern reformations and to offer alternative entangled histories have caused scholars to modify urban and state perspectives.³ The focus on the Wittenberg-Zürich-Geneva triad of Protestant churches and the Catholic Church's Rome-Madrid axis has been deconstructed in favor of a cross-confessional, multi-layered, and multi-actor analysis of early modern Christianity.⁴ Moreover, as witnessed by the growing number of studies devoted to religious mobility, religion was not confined to the territorial boundaries of states and cities.⁵ Even if urban and state authorities consistently tightened their control over ecclesiastical institutions and clerical leadership, they were limited in their capacity to monitor and manage the persons, goods, ideas and technologies circulating in and beyond their territorial circumscriptions. Therefore this collection seeks to focus on the scope, contingencies, and outcomes of cross-border exchange.

This volume offers a selection of papers presented at the fifth annual RefoRC-conference, hosted by KU Leuven in May 2015, which questioned how the concept of 'transregional history' could be useful to decenter and reinterpret the Reformation era.⁶ Transregional history functions to some extent as an early modern equivalent to the strand of 'transnational history' practiced by modern historians, while taking its main inspiration from an *histoire croisée*: inspired by

3 S. Ditchfield, "Decentering the Catholic Reformation: Papacy and Peoples of the Early Modern World", *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* 101 (2010) 186–208; G. Marcocci, "Too Much to Rule: States and Empires across the Early Modern World", *Journal of Early Modern History* 20 (2016) 511–25.

4 See for instance: J. Machielsen, *Martin Delrio: Demonology and Scholarship in the Counter-Reformation* (Oxford: British Academy/Oxford University Press, 2015) or the special issue on 'Withdrawal and Engagement in the Long Seventeenth Century', with several case studies taken from various regions in Europe in the *Journal of Early Modern Christianity* 1.2 (2014) as well as A. Bamji/G. H. Janssen/M. Laven (ed.), *The Ashgate Research Companion to the Counter-Reformation* (Farnham/Burlington: Ashgate, 2013) for a similar view on Catholic religion.

5 C. Roll/F. Pohle/M. Myrczek (ed.), *Grenzen und Grenzüberschreitung. Bilanz und Perspektiven der Frühneuezeitforschung* (Frühneuezeit-Impulse 1; Köln/Weimar/Wien: Böhlau, 2010); H. P. Jürgens/T. Weller (ed.), *Religion und Mobilität: zum Verhältnis von raumbezogener Mobilität und religiöser Identitätsbildung im frühneuzeitlichen Europa* (Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für Europäische Geschichte Mainz. Abteilung für abendländische Religionsgeschichte. Beiheft 81; Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2010).

6 The conference was organized within the framework of the KU Leuven-funded BOF-project OT/13/033: 'The Making of Transregional Catholicism: Print Culture in the Ecclesiastical Province of Cambrai, 1559–1659' (promotors V. Soen and J. Verberckmoes, and dr. Alexander Soetaert as researcher); project's website to be found at www.transregionalhistory.eu. The database built during this project can be searched through: https://www.arts.kuleuven.be/nieuwetijd/english/odis/ICC_search.

advances in global history, it emphasizes contact, transfer and exchange, translation and transmission, and mobility along and across changing and unstable boundaries in early modern Europe, a continent composed of fractured states and regions.⁷ At the Leuven conference, leading experts elaborated on the theme of ‘transregional reformations’ in relation to their own field of research, while participants presented short papers that engaged with the subsequent discussion on how cross-border movements shaped early modern reformations. Covering a geographical space that ranges from Scandinavia to Spain and from England to Hungary, the selected chapters in this volume apply the transregional method to a vast array of topics, such as the history of theological discussion, knowledge transfer, pastoral care, visual allegory, ecclesiastical organization, confessional relations, religious exile, and university politics. Rather than princes and urban governments steering religion, Europe’s early modern reformations emerge as events shaped by authors and translators, publishers and booksellers, students and professors, exiles and refugees, and clergy and (female) members of religious orders crossing borders.

I. Transfer and Exchange

The volume starts by showing how transfer and exchange beyond territorial circumscriptions or proto-national identifications shaped many sixteenth-century reformations. Despite obvious tendencies to strengthen city- and state-centered churches during the Early Modern Period, religious reform increasingly depended on the transregional exchanges that took place beyond urban limits and state borders. During the past few decades scholars have raised many questions concerning the validity of the confessionalization model for regions beyond the Holy Roman Empire and its exceptional relationship between Church(es) and State. In other regions, support from abroad, rather than local power struggles, provide a better explanation for contingent outcomes.⁸ The

7 J. Duindam, “Early Modern Europe: Beyond the Strictures of Modernization and National Historiography”, *European History Quarterly* 40 (2010) 606–623; M. Werner/B. Zimmermann, “Beyond Comparison: Histoire Croisée and the Challenge of Reflexivity”, *History and Theory*, 45.1 (2006) 30–50. M. Middell/K. Naumann, “Global History and the Spatial Turn: From the Impact of Area Studies to the Study of Critical Junctures of Globalization”, *Journal of Global History* 5 (2010) 149–170. For a more detailed discussion on the merits of transregional history as a methodology for the study of early modern history, see: V. Soen/B. De Ridder/A. Soetaert/W. Thomas/J. Verberckmoes/S. Verreyken, “How to do Transregional History: A Concept, Method and Tool for Early Modern Border Research”, *Journal of Early Modern History* 21 (2017) 343–364.

8 C. H. Parker, *Faith on the Margins: Catholics and Catholicism in the Dutch Golden Age* (Cambridge Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2008); B. Kaplan *et al.* (ed.), *Catholic Com-*

chapters of Jonas van Tol, Barbara Diefendorf, Michel Boeglin, and Gábor Ittzés analyze how elites, clerics, professors, and theologians helped to steer the course of the early modern reformations in transgressing territorial boundaries.

In a first chapter, Jonas van Tol examines the French Wars of Religion and their aftermath from the perspective of what happened along and across the borders of the Kingdom of France. Rather than continuing to comparatively analyze Franco-German international and diplomatic relations, he carefully argues for the importance of a transregional analysis of the Wars of Religion that instead focuses on the whole Rhineland. Giving parallel attention to political and religious developments in both France and the Empire helps to explain when and why German aristocrats decided to intervene in the French Wars of Religion, or inversely, when and why they did not. Thus, Van Tol demonstrates that the German Elector Palatine Friedrich III's famous conversion to Calvinism, which caused new divisions within the imperial Lutheran party, was in fact inextricably related to contemporary events in France.

Focusing on the immediate aftermath of the French Wars of Religion, Barbara Diefendorf shows that cross-border exchanges between Italy and Spain were formative in the crystallization of seventeenth-century French Catholicism. While anti-Italian and anti-Spanish sentiments peaked during the religious turmoil of the sixteenth century, these feelings paradoxically led to an increasing interest in the forms of Catholic renewal promoted by religious orders such as the Capuchins and the Discalced Carmelites. Even though wealthy patrons generally granted and facilitated the new foundation of convents in France, they were nevertheless initially inhabited by Italian and Spanish friars and nuns. When the religious orders eventually recruited local novices, tensions broke out between the Spanish and Italian religious clinging to the original ethos of their order and their French benefactors. In a final reflection, Diefendorf asks to what extent the waning number of Italian and Spanish religious in some provinces forced the Capuchins and Discalced Carmelites to deviate from the founding models and become French Catholics.

The next two chapters argue that the circulation of both ideas and persons beyond borders helped to shape the Protestant Reformation. Michel Boeglin studies how Spanish elites had adopted the ideas and insights of Luther and other German reformers from the earliest stages of the Reformation. Humanists such as Juan de Valdés (c. 1500–40) and Constantino de la Fuente (1502–60) developed and appropriated German theologies within the Spanish (and wider Mediterranean) context, despite the 'national assumption' that the Reformation failed

munities in Protestant States: Britain and the Netherlands c. 1570–1720 (Manchester/New York: Manchester University Press, 2009); A. Walsham, *Catholic Reformation in Protestant Britain* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014).

to establish itself on the Iberian Peninsula. The publications of the two humanists followed both the current political developments within the Holy Roman Empire and the Papacy's subsequent reactions; thus, these Spanish works should be understood as a part of a pan-European continuum, rather than as isolated texts published on the margins of the continent.

Gábor Itzész shows how Protestant theologies traveled widely, and how, in this context, books and treatises published across the Holy Roman Empire acted as pivotal components to this process. Itzész deals with the rather specific Reformation 'idea' that departed souls can return in forms visible to man's earthly senses. This idea, developed in the mid-sixteenth century by such Lutheran theologians as the prominent Philip Melanchthon (1497–1560) and the lesser-known Melchior Specker (*fl.* 1554–69) from Strasbourg, was appropriated and popularized both within the wider literature on *ars moriendi* and in theological reflection on the soul's post-mortem state, even if it would later be rejected by mainstream theology. The emphasis on books as vectors of mobility leads to interpretations that are explored throughout the remainder of this volume.

II. Translation and Transmission

The second part of this volume is devoted to the acceleration of cultural transfer that resulted from the newly-invented printing press, by translation as well as transmission of texts and images. In the earliest years of printing, translated devotional texts stemming from the late Middle Ages proved to be the key to spiritual reinvigoration. Showcasing the widespread vitality of Rheno-Flemish mysticism, the many printed editions of Thomas a Kempis' (1380–1471) *Imitation of Christ* and Ludolph the Carthusian's (d. 1378) *Life of Christ* serve as two exemplary texts that were translated from Latin into vernacular languages and that underscore how the printing press functioned as an agent of transmission of religious ideas across boundaries. The advent of the Reformation era only enhanced the importance of translations for religious life and devotion, connecting regions and languages in a number of surprising ways. As the essays of Alexandra Walsham, Alexander Soetaert, Zsombor Tóth and Grażyna Jurkowlaniec demonstrate, translation and transmission between vernaculars and Latin (which functioned as the common mediating language) directly affected developments in both the Catholic and Protestant churches and confessions.

In recent years, the flourishing field of *translation studies* has emphasized the distinctive process of translating a text.⁹ The act of translation mobilizes scholars

9 P. Burke/R. Po-chia Hsia (ed.), *Cultural Translation in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press/European Science Foundation, 2007).

and amateurs to pursue goals that transcend their specific linguistic enterprise. Translation involves both negotiation with the host language, an exchange of ideas, and a compromised outcome; it is decontextualization followed by re-contextualization. Attending to the production, distribution, and readership of translations leads to a more sophisticated understanding of the crossing of cultural and state boundaries. In entangled cultures, translations change how these cultures work. When applied to religious cultures and the Reformation, translation studies, although viewed to be of primary importance, still await further analysis, especially in regard to transregional history. The four essays that comprise the second part of this volume deal with this method of interpreting Reformation in texts and images.

In the first two chapters of this section, the authors address the importance of translations in the vernacular for early modern English Catholicism. The fate of English Catholicism is no longer understood as being insular, but emblematic of a wider transregional context of opposing reformations in early modern Europe. Alexandra Walsham challenges a traditional English insular perspective by interrogating the religious texts that moved from the continental mainland to the British Isles. She addresses a typology of Catholic books translated into English that contain a variety of works covering topics such as controversy, catechisms, and the devotional treatises of crucial authors like Luis de Granada and François de Sales. Walsham considers translation as a positive and creative process for adaptation, dialogue, and compromise that enabled cultural interaction and cross-fertilization across the Channel, while demonstrating that some of the continental Catholic texts were also adapted for and directed to non-Catholic readership on the British Isles.

Analysing the same corpus of English Catholic translations, Alexander Soetaert points to the extent to which interactions between English Catholics residing on the continent and their host societies helped to shape the texts. Soetaert closely monitors the publication of both English and French translations in those continental towns where English Catholics gathered or regularly passed through for religious and educational purposes, such as Douai and Saint-Omer in the Ecclesiastical Province of Cambrai. Establishing a striking connection between the publication of translations in English and French, he suggests that the Cambrai region became the single most important hub for the transfer of French, Italian, and Spanish religious literature into England.

The remainder of the volume's second section explores the transformative dimensions of the translation of texts and images in territories that are usually considered to be on Europe's margins. Zsombor Tóth, for example, questions how translations of English Puritan texts emerged in Hungary and Transylvania. Since the local intellectual elites there appear to have had a very limited command of the English language, Tóth first highlights the importance of Latin as an

intermediary language in translating English Puritan literature. By elaborating the case of István Matkó, he suggests that Eastern European translators made the English originals fit within local contexts. He also demonstrates that the reception of English Puritanism was a complex process of transfer, translation, and rewriting.

Art historian Grażyna Jurkowlaniec follows the extraordinary journey across Europe of *Typus Ecclesiae*, an innovative representation of the Church that originated in Warmia, Prussia (now in northern Poland). The Polish Cardinal Stanislaus Hosius played a key role in the distribution of the image, as he had copies printed in Italy and sent to members of noble and royal families and religious leaders throughout Europe. Whether the Cardinal sent the copies for politico-diplomatic reasons or for religious instruction (or both), he always sought to strengthen the position of the Catholic Church vis-à-vis the ‘heretics’. Jurkowlaniec carries out a careful inquiry into the actors involved in this process of transregional transfer and the various political and religious interests that were at stake.

III. Mobility and Exile

The third and final part of this volume examines the importance of mobility and exile in causing transregional reformations. Traditionally, the exile dimension of religious migration has figured prominently in the historiography of the Early Modern Era.¹⁰ The significance of the experience of dislocation within Calvinism led Heiko Oberman to coin the well-known concept of the ‘Reformation of the Refugee’, arguing that exile was crucial to the development of Reformed churches and their doctrine, thus establishing a distinct ‘exile theology’.¹¹ Due to their smaller numbers, Catholic refugees have been historically neglected, but a series of new studies have recently shed light on their particular experiences.¹² Most

10 Jürgens/Weller (ed.), *Religion und Mobilität*; J. Spohnholz/G. K. Waite (ed.), *Exile and Religious Identity, 1500–1800* (London: Pickering & Chatto 2014).

11 H.A. Oberman, “Europa afflicta: The Reformation of the Refugees”, in P. A. Dykema (ed.), *John Calvin and the Reformation of the Refugees* (Travaux d’humanisme et Renaissance 464; Genève: Droz, 2009) 177–94. First published in *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* 83 (1992) 91–111.

12 For an overview of Catholic refugee communities, see: B. Braun, “Katholische Glaubensflüchtlinge: eine Spurensuche im Europa der Frühen Neuzeit”, *Historisches Jahrbuch* 130 (2010) 505–76 and Id., “Katholische Konfessionsmigration im Europa der Frühen Neuzeit – Stand und Perspektiven der Forschung”, in Jürgens/Weller, *Religion und Mobilität*, 75–112. Recent volumes and case studies on this subject include: R. Descimon/J.J. Ruiz Ibáñez, *Les ligueurs de l’exil: le refuge catholique français après 1594* (Seysssel: Champ Vallon, 2005); L. Chambers/T. O’Connor (ed.), *Forming Catholic Communities: Irish, Scots, and English College Networks in Europe, 1568–1918* (Catholic Christendom, 1300–1700; Leiden: Brill 2017)

notably, Geert Janssen's recent study on Catholic exiles during the Dutch Revolt established that dislocation had a significant impact on the Counter-Reformation in the Low Countries, as he claims that Catholics sharpened both their religious ideas and identities during exile and became increasingly militant. Adapting Oberman's aforementioned term, Janssen has coined this process the 'Counter-Reformation of the Refugee', positing that a 'Catholic International' existed alongside a 'Calvinist International'.¹³ Nicholas Terpstra uses the fate of religious refugees to propose an alternative history of the Reformation, arguing that the pursuit of a greater purity was increasingly influential within late-medieval Christian communities, resulting first in the large-scale expulsion of Jews and Muslims and then of fellow-Christians from the Iberian peninsula.¹⁴

Even so, religious mobility included a wide array of patterns and motivations, including pilgrimage, study, pastoral care, grand tours and, probably most far-reaching, voluntary or involuntary migration. The wider pattern of cross-border movements in the Reformation era form the backbone of the contributions of Kajsa Brilkman, Violet Soen, Timothy Orr, Johannes Müller and Christiaan Ravensbergen. Collectively these authors examine the connection between transregional mobility and the formation of religious identities. The experience of both individual and group border crossings had wide-ranging repercussions: forced to mediate between the culture they left behind and their new host society, migrants and exiles became vectors of newly-embodied identities and beliefs.

This volume's last section highlights the importance of academic mobility and intellectual networks for both the Lutheran and the Catholic Reformation. Two essays argue that early modern religious migration and exile often relied on previous patterns of pilgrimage or academic peregrination. Kajsa Brilkman reconsiders the Swede Olaus Petri's student years at Wittenberg and their later impact on his efforts as Scandinavia's foremost reformer. She dismisses the idea of a direct or immediate transfer of Lutheran thought between Wittenberg and Stockholm, yet underlines how Petri's evolving views on marriage – embodied by being a cleric and marrying a local bride and then defending this choice in print –

and C. Bowden/J.E. Kelly (ed.), *The English Convents in Exile, 1600–1800: Communities, Culture, and Identity* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013); V. Soen, "Exile Encounters and Cross-Border Mobility in Early Modern Borderlands. The Ecclesiastical Province of Cambrai as a Trans-regional Node (1559–1600)", *Belgeo-Belgian Journal of Geography* 2/2015 (online 15 July 2015).

13 G. Janssen, "The Counter-Reformation of the Refugee: Exile and the Shaping of Catholic Militancy in the Dutch Revolt", *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 63 (2012) 671–92; Id., *The Dutch Revolt and Catholic Exile in Reformation Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014).

14 N. Terpstra, *Religious Refugees in the Early Modern World: An Alternative History of the Reformation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015).

were the result of his prior academic mobility and his willingness as an individual to adapt and translate Reformation ideas in practice and print.

Violet Soen focuses on the foundation of new universities in the borderlands between France and the Habsburg Low Countries during the mid-sixteenth century, as two institutions of higher education, one in French Reims and the other in Habsburg Douai, opened a mere fifteen years apart. Both universities originated from the newly-felt need to contain students and scholars within the borders of their respective states in order to prevent ‘contagion’ by the ‘heretic’ neighbor/enemy. In an unanticipated outcome, the Wars of Religion caused students and scholars to flee across those same borders, in order to find a safe haven at the ‘foreign’ institution. As a result, Catholic refugees from the British Isles eventually attended both borderland universities, which sparked further cross-border solidarity between Catholic elites. Despite the ‘proto-nationalist’ discourse of the foundational bulls of the universities of Reims and Douai, academic transfer and mobility helped to create a ‘transregional Catholicism’ in the Franco-Habsburg borderlands.

The next two chapters offer interesting perspectives on Oberman’s thesis. Reconsidering the case of Jan Hus (1369–1415), Timothy Orr investigates why the prominent Czech reformer chose to remain a member of his community. Orr suggests that even during times of persecution remaining at home was actually a much more common choice than exile, and therefore advocates that Reformation history should pay greater attention to the idea of ‘remaining’, in addition to the theologies of martyrdom and exile.

Johannes Müller focuses on the particular case of Dirck Volckertsz. Coornhert (1522–90), a well-known artist and writer from the Low Countries, who never had an academic theological education and is therefore often considered to be a ‘lay theologian’. Müller argues that Coornhert’s rather unorthodox views had been shaped by successive periods of banishment. These punishments turned him into an anti-confessional Christian believer, who never broke with the Catholic Church, but deplored the divisions that had grown between various Christian churches. Consequently, he developed a rather personal spiritualism. Hence, Müller urges the reader to abandon the concept of ‘exile theology’ as a typical Reformed phenomenon and refrain from identifying it as a mere process of radicalization.

The final chapter to this volume reconstructs the 1578 emigration of Reformed preachers from the Palatinate to the Low Countries, and, more particularly, to the eastern province of Guelders (Gelderland or Gelre). Christiaan Ravensbergen describes how after the death of the Elector Palatine Friedrich III in 1576, the Lutheran succession caused the forced departure of several hundred Reformed professors, ministers and schoolmasters. Local Reformed patrons in and around Dutch Guelders decided to attract some of these exiles from the Palatinate in

order to provide ministers for their ongoing Protestantization of the province. However, these encountered only limited success: language problems began soon after the arrival of the German ministers, as many were unable to address their new communities in Dutch. Although most studies overlook such language problems, Ravensbergen demonstrates how this type of barrier was a serious obstacle to confessional migration.

IV. Periphery and Borderlands

Focusing on the process of ‘crossing borders’ in peripheries and borderlands, all chapters contribute to the de-centering of religious reform in early modern Europe.¹⁵ As a result, marginal regions figure prominently alongside central ones. Actually, a distinction between center and periphery in terms of Reformation strategies increasingly seems misleading. Boeglin reminds us that Luther’s ideas, as well as those of many other German reformers, circulated in humanist circles on the Iberian peninsula shortly after 1520, showing that Spain was by no means on the fringes of the ongoing religious debate. Covering the same pivotal era, Brillman alleges that Sweden was well-connected to the German-speaking lands through an intensive book trade, even if contemporary Scandinavia constituted the periphery of European book production. Itzész, starting his analysis in Strasbourg rather than Wittenberg, explains how Lutheran beliefs concerning departed souls changed through border-crossings within the Holy Roman Empire. Focusing on Catholic iconography, Jurkowlaniec traces the *Typus Ecclesiae*’s impressive spread from the Baltic coast and Polish regions, first moving northward towards Sweden and then south and west towards Italy, France, the Low Countries, and Portugal. With respect to Central Europe, Tóth argues that Puritanism was not merely transposed from England to Hungary and Transylvania during the second half of the seventeenth century, but followed its own distinct course of development. Finally, Walsham and Soetaert use English translations of Catholic texts to question Anglocentric visions that for a long period have shaped the historiography of religious print culture in the British Isles.

While giving due attention to peripheries, this volume also highlights the central role of borderlands as hotbeds of religious experiments in the Early Modern Period.¹⁶ Discussing the Rhineland as a natural division between the

15 H. Louthan/G. Murdock (ed.), *A Companion to the Reformation in Central Europe* (Brill’s Companions to the Christian Tradition 61; Leiden: Brill, 2015); T. Ó hAnnracháin, *Catholic Europe, 1592–1648: Centre and Peripheries* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015).

16 Case studies on the reformation in borderlands include: B. Forclaz, “La Suisse frontière de

Empire and France, Van Tol argues that this region did not constitute a clearly delineated border, but a frontier resulting from successive warfare. He understands the Rhineland as a multilingual zone, influenced by both Paris and the centers of imperial power, and asks how the proximity of France helped to shape the relations between Lutherans within the Empire. Soen and Soetaert shift their attention towards France's border with the Low Countries. The newly-established Ecclesiastical Province of Cambrai of 1559 was designed to incorporate the French-speaking provinces more closely into the Habsburg Low Countries. Nonetheless, the dismembered Ecclesiastical Province of Reims still constituted an important point of reference within the sacred landscape, spurring mobility between the universities of Douai and Reims during the Wars of Religion. Similar to the Rhineland, this border region proved to be a hub of mobility and cultural transfer between not only the Low Countries and France, but also the European mainland and the British Isles, even though it was a border region that frequently turned into a theatre of war throughout the Early Modern Period. Ravensbergen offers another perspective in his work on Guelders, a region in the east of the emerging Dutch Republic that has been largely neglected in studies of confessional migration in favor of the coastal provinces of the Low Countries, such as Holland and Zeeland.

Together, the chapters on peripheries and borderlands suggest the hypothesis that areas 'in between' centers, though often subject to warfare and looting, actually functioned as channels of transregional contacts, transfer, translation, and mobility that effectively changed the course of early modern reformations. Such a perspective is valuable since it shows that the better-known vertical relations between centers and peripheries were accompanied by rather unexpected horizontal connections, linking regions that have long been viewed as having little importance to wider historical developments. By locating change outside the centers of state and urban power, the essays in this volume contend that regions on the geographical, political, and historiographical periphery made significant, and often surprisingly innovative, contributions to the Protestant and Catholic Reformations in the Early Modern Era. For that reason, it is the

catholicité? Contre-Réforme et Réforme catholique dans le Corps helvétique", *Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Religions- und Kulturgeschichte* 106 (2012) 567–83; P. Denis (ed.), *Protestantisme aux frontières: la réforme dans le Duché de Limbourg et dans la Principauté de Liège (16e–19e siècles)* (Aubel: Gason, 1985); W. Monter, *Witchcraft in France and Switzerland: the Borderlands during the Reformation* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1976); R. Esser, "Upper Guelders' Four Points of the Compass: Historiography and Transregional Families in a Contested Border Region between the Empire, the Spanish Monarchy and the Dutch Republic", in B. De Ridder/V. Soen/W. Thomas/S. Verreyken (ed.), *Transregional Territories: Crossing Borders in the Early Modern Low Countries and Beyond* (Habsburg Worlds 2; Turnhout: Brepols, forthcoming).

conviction of the editors that Europe's peripheries and borderlands deserve a more central place in Reformation studies.

Acknowledgements

The editors wish to express their warmest thanks to KU Leuven's Research Council, which funded their initial ventures into the transregional dynamic of the reformations in early modern Europe. Both the Research Group of Early Modern History at the Faculty of Arts and the Research Unit of History of Church and Theology at the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies have been extremely supportive of research into the religious history of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. In addition, the Research Foundation Flanders (FWO) and KU Leuven's Doctoral School of Humanities and Social Sciences provided indispensable financial support for inviting both senior and junior scholars to this scholarly meeting.

The Leuven conference would not have been possible without the appreciated support of prof. dr. Herman Selderhuis and Karla Apperloo of RefoRC, who contributed in bringing together Reformation scholars from across the world. The editors cordially thank *Capilla Nova* and *Het Danshuis*, the board of Saint Michael's church, and Alumni Leuven for their fruitful collaboration in organizing a music and dance performance of Orlandus Lassus' *Lagrimae di San Pietro*. As always, the Maurits Sabbe Library of the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies kindly supported us in hosting a temporary exhibition with rare books. Our colleagues and collaborators at KU Leuven, especially Els Agten, Bram De Ridder, Antonio Gerace, Luke R. Murray, Szilvia Sziráki, and Sophie Verreyken did a tremendous job of providing logistical support throughout the conference.

Finally, the editors wish to thank all who assisted in the preparation of this volume, especially the anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments and suggestions, Bert Tops for compiling the indices and dr. Ryan McGuinness for editing the English. We thank the publishing house Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht in Göttingen and the general editor of the Refo500 Academic Series, prof. dr. Herman Selderhuis, for having accepted our volume. We wish our readers an enjoyable and fruitful experience and hope that the book will inspire them to further explore the interesting topic of transregional reformations.

Bibliography

Bamji, A./Janssen, G. H./Laven, M. (ed.), *The Ashgate Research Companion to the Counter-Reformation* (Farnham/Burlington: Ashgate, 2013).

- Benedict, P., *Rouen during the Wars of Religion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981).
- Bowden, C./Kelly, J. E. (ed.), *The English Convents in Exile, 1600–1800: Communities, Culture, and Identity* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013).
- Braun, B., “Katholische Glaubensflüchtlinge: eine Spurensuche im Europa der Frühen Neuzeit”, *Historisches Jahrbuch* 130 (2010) 505–76.
- Braun, B., “Katholische Konfessionsmigration im Europa der Frühen Neuzeit – Stand und Perspektiven der Forschung”, in H. P. Jürgens/T. Weller (ed.), *Religion und Mobilität: zum Verhältnis von raumbezogener Mobilität und religiöser Identitätsbildung im frühneuzeitlichen Europa* (Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für Europäische Geschichte Mainz. Abteilung für abendländische Religionsgeschichte. Beiheft 81; Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2010).
- Brockmann, T./Weiss, D. J. (ed.), *Das Konfessionalisierungsparadigma. Leistungen, Probleme, Grenzen* (Bayreuther Historische Kolloquien 18; Münster: Aschendorff Verlag, 2013).
- Burke, P./Po-chia Hsia, R. (ed.), *Cultural Translation in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press/European Science Foundation, 2007).
- Büttgen, P./Duhamelle, C. (ed.), *Religion ou confession. Un bilan franco-allemand sur l'époque moderne (XVIe–XVIIIe siècles)* (Paris: Maison des Sciences de l'homme, 2010).
- Chambers, L./O'Connor, T. (ed.), *Forming Catholic Communities: Irish, Scots, and English College Networks in Europe, 1568–1918* (Catholic Christendom, 1300–1700; Leiden: Brill 2017).
- Denis, P. (ed.), *Protestantisme aux frontières: la réforme dans le Duché de Limbourg et dans la Principauté de Liège (16e–19e siècles)* (Aubel: Gason, 1985).
- De Ridder, B./Soen, V./Thomas, W./Verreyken, S. (ed.), *Transregional Territories: Crossing Borders in the Early Modern Low Countries and Beyond* (Habsburg Worlds 2; Turnhout: Brepols, forthcoming).
- Descimon, R./Ruiz Ibáñez, J. J., *Les ligueurs de l'exil: le refuge catholique français après 1594* (Seysse: Champ Vallon, 2005).
- Ditchfield, S., “Decentering the Catholic Reformation: Papacy and Peoples of the Early Modern World”, *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* 101 (2010) 186–208.
- Duindam, J., “Early Modern Europe: Beyond the Strictures of Modernization and National Historiography”, *European History Quarterly* 40 (2010) 606–23.
- Esser, R., “Upper Guelders’ Four Points of the Compass: Historiography and Transregional Families in a Contested Border Region between the Empire, the Spanish Monarchy and the Dutch Republic”, in B. De Ridder/V. Soen/W. Thomas/S. Verreyken (ed.), *Transregional Territories: Crossing Borders in the Early Modern Low Countries and Beyond* (Habsburg Worlds 2; Turnhout: Brepols, forthcoming).
- Forclaz, B., “La Suisse frontière de catholicité? Contre-Réforme et Réforme catholique dans le Corps helvétique”, *Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Religions- und Kulturgeschichte* 106 (2012) 567–83.
- Janssen, G., “The Counter-Reformation of the Refugee: Exile and the Shaping of Catholic Militancy in the Dutch Revolt”, *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 63 (2012) 671–92.
- Janssen, G., *The Dutch Revolt and Catholic Exile in Reformation Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014).

- Jürgens, H. P./Weller, T. (ed.), *Religion und Mobilität: zum Verhältnis von raumbezogener Mobilität und religiöser Identitätsbildung im frühneuzeitlichen Europa* (Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für Europäische Geschichte Mainz. Abteilung für abendländische Religionsgeschichte. Beiheft 81; Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2010).
- Kaplan, B. et al. (ed.), *Catholic Communities in Protestant States: Britain and the Netherlands c. 1570–1720* (Manchester/New York: Manchester University Press, 2009).
- Lottin, A., *Lille, citadelle de la Contre Réforme? 1598–1667* (Dunkerque: Westhoek-Éditions, 1984).
- Lotz-Heumann, U., “Confessionalization”, in M. Laven/A. Bamji/G. H. Janssen (ed.), *The Ashgate Companion to the Counter-Reformation* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013) 33–53.
- Louthan, H./Murdoch, G. (ed.), *A Companion to the Reformation in Central Europe* (Brill’s Companions to the Christian Tradition 61; Leiden: Brill, 2015).
- Machielsen, J., *Martin Delrio: Demonology and Scholarship in the Counter-Reformation* (Oxford: British Academy/Oxford University Press, 2015).
- Marcocci, G., “Too Much to Rule: States and Empires across the Early Modern World”, *Journal of Early Modern History* 20 (2016) 511–25.
- Marnef, G., *Antwerp in the Age of Reformation: Underground Protestantism in a Commercial Metropolis 1550–1577* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996).
- Marshall, P., “Confessionalization, Confessionalism and Confusion in the English Reformation”, in T. Mayer (ed.), *Reforming Reformation* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013) 43–64.
- Middell, M./Naumann, K., “Global History and the Spatial Turn: From the Impact of Area Studies to the Study of Critical Junctures of Globalization”, *Journal of Global History* 5 (2010) 149–170.
- Moeller, B., *Reichsstadt und Reformation* (Schriften des Vereins für Reformationsgeschichte 180; Gütersloh: Mohr, 1962).
- Monter, W., *Witchcraft in France and Switzerland: the Borderlands during the Reformation* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1976);
- Ó hAnnracháin, T., *Catholic Europe, 1592–1648. Centre and Peripheries* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015).
- Oberman, H. A., “Europa afflicta: The Reformation of the Refugees”, in P. A. Dykema (ed.), *John Calvin and the Reformation of the Refugees* (Travaux d’humanisme et Renaissance 464; Genève: Droz, 2009) 177–94 (first published in *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* 83 (1992) 91–111).
- Parker, C. H., *Faith on the Margins: Catholics and Catholicism in the Dutch Golden Age* (Cambridge Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2008).
- Roll, C./Pohle, F./ Myrczek, M. (ed.), *Grenzen und Grenzüberschreitung. Bilanz und Perspektiven der Frühneuezeitforschung* (Frühneuezeit-Impulse 1; Köln/Weimar/Wien: Böhlau, 2010).
- Soen, V., “Exile Encounters and Cross-Border Mobility in Early Modern Borderlands. The Ecclesiastical Province of Cambrai as a Transregional Node (1559–1600)”, *Belgeo-Belgian Journal of Geography* 2/2015 (online 15 July 2015).
- Soen, V./De Ridder, B./Soetaert, A./Thomas, W./Verberckmoes, J./Verreyken, S., “How to do Transregional History: A Concept, Method and Tool for Early Modern Border Research”, *Journal of Early Modern History* 21 (2017) 343–364.
- Spohnholz, J./Waite, G. K. (ed.), *Exile and Religious Identity, 1500–1800* (London: Pickering & Chatto 2014).

Terpstra, N., *Religious Refugees in the Early Modern World: An Alternative History of the Reformation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015).

Walsham, A., *Catholic Reformation in Protestant Britain* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014).

Werner, M./Zimmermann, B., “Beyond Comparison: Histoire Croisée and the Challenge of Reflexivity”, *History and Theory*, 45.1 (2006) 30–50.

I. Transfer and Exchange